



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/587,198	03/06/2007	Andrzej Malek	P2004J008	6712

7590 12/23/2008
EXXONMOBIL RESEARCH AND ENGINEERING COMPANY
1545 Route 22 East, P.O.Box 900
Annandale, NJ 08801-0900

EXAMINER

DAVIS, BRIAN J

ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
----------	--------------

1621

MAIL DATE	DELIVERY MODE
-----------	---------------

12/23/2008

PAPER

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Office Action Summary	Application No. 10/587,198	Applicant(s) MALEK ET AL.	
	Examiner Brian J. Davis	Art Unit 1621	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☐ Responsive to communication(s) filed on ____.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-39 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) ____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) ____ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1-39 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☒ Claim(s) 6-15, 20, 28, 29, 34, 36 is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) ____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☒ The drawing(s) filed on 25 July 2006 is/are: a) ☒ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☒ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☒ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. ____.
 3. ☒ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413) |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | Paper No(s)/Mail Date. ____. |
| 3) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08) | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application |
| Paper No(s)/Mail Date <u>3/30/07</u> . | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: ____. |

DETAILED ACTION

Claim Objections

Claims 6-15, 20, 28, 29, 34 and 36 are objected to under 37 CFR 1.75(c) as being in improper form because a multiple dependent claim may depend from a preceding claim in the alternative only. See MPEP § 608.01(n). Normally, such claims would not be further treated on the merits. However, given the particulars of the instant application and in the interest of furthering prosecution, the above claims have been treated on the merits.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 112

The following is a quotation of the second paragraph of 35 U.S.C. 112:

The specification shall conclude with one or more claims particularly pointing out and distinctly claiming the subject matter which the applicant regards as his invention.

Claims 1 and 29 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 112, second paragraph, as being indefinite for failing to particularly point out and distinctly claim the subject matter which applicant regards as the invention. It is unclear why the specification explicitly excludes the metals Pt and Pd (e.g. specification paragraph [0010]) yet the claims encompass these metals. That is, there appears to be a direct contradiction between the teachings of the specification and the claimed invention.

The remaining claims are also rejected under 35 USC 112, second paragraph, as claims which depend from indefinite claims are also indefinite. *Ex parte Cordova*, 10 USPQ 2d 1949, 1952 (PTO Bd. App. 1989).

Allowable Subject Matter

The subject matter of claims 1-39 would be allowable once the objections and 112 rejections outlined above have been overcome. The following is a statement of the examiner's reasons for indicating allowable subject matter:

The key to the instant invention is the preparation of the catalyst. WO 2004/045767 (cited by applicant in the IDS) teaches the key step in the preparation of the instant catalysts: that of depositing the catalytically active metal on a support in the form of an organic complex, decomposing the complex and then reducing the metal to form the active catalyst (p. 9 paragraph [036] and following). These prior art catalysts are useful in Fischer-Tropsch reactions and as absorbents for the removal of organosulfur compounds from hydrocarbons (abstract; Examples).

The closest representative prior art with respect to the synthesis of sterically hindered amino-ether alcohols appears to be US 4,487,967 (also cited by applicant in the IDS, and in the specification), which teaches that such compounds may be produced using "...any of the known supported hydrogenation catalysts" (column 3, line 66). There is no teaching in either WO 2004/045767 or US 4,487,967 that would lead one of ordinary skill in the art to use the catalysts of the former in the reactions of the latter. Nor would one of ordinary skill in the art at the time of the invention have found it obvious to have undertaken such a modification of the teaching of the prior art in order to arrive at those of the instant invention.

Conclusion

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Brian J. Davis whose telephone number is 571-272-0638. The examiner can normally be reached on M-F 8:30-5:00.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Daniel M. Sullivan can be reached at 571-272-0779. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

/Brian J. Davis/
Primary Examiner, Art Unit 1621
12/11/08